

**Policy & Resources Panel  
Agenda Item 069  
Appendices A, B and C**



**OPTIONS FOR LOCAL APPOINTMENT OF EXTERNAL AUDITORS – Analysis**

Options	Description	Possible advantages	Possible disadvantages
Option 1 – Make a stand-alone appointment	Procuring a stand-alone appointment overseen by a specially set up independent Audit Panel. The members of the Panel would need to be wholly or a majority of independent members. This option would therefore incur costs associated with the recruitment of independent members and of maintaining the panel. Under this option, the Authority would not be able to take advantage of reduced fees that may be available through joint or national procurement contracts.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Full ownership of the process</li> <li>• Fully bespoke contract with the auditor</li> <li>• Tendering process more based on local circumstances (within EU procurement rules)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• May experience difficulties in appointing majority independent panel members and independent panel chair</li> <li>• Will need to ensure that panel members are suitably qualified to understand and participate in the panel’s function</li> <li>• Will have to cover panel expenses completely</li> <li>• May not be able to procure at a lower cost, e.g. depending on authority location, risk of limited provider choice and a single authority contract may be less attractive to some providers</li> <li>• Will not achieve economies of scale</li> </ul>
Option 2 – Set up a Joint Auditor Panel	Joining with other Authorities to set up a joint independent Auditor Panel. This option would spread the cost across a number of local authorities. There would be a greater opportunity for negotiating some economies of scale by being able to offer a larger, combined contract value, however, the decision making body would be further removed from local input.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Less administration than a sole auditor panel</li> <li>• Will be able to share administration expenses</li> <li>• May be easier to attract suitable panel members</li> </ul> <p>If procuring a joint audit contract:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• May still be a relatively tailored process</li> <li>• May be able to achieve some economies of scale</li> </ul> <p>If procuring separate audit contracts:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• An opportunity for fully bespoke contracts with the auditor if the group of authorities can agree</li> </ul>	<p>If procuring a joint audit contract:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• May need to compromise on arrangements or auditor contract</li> <li>• May not end up with first choice of auditor, compared to an individual auditor panel. If a large group of authorities work together and decide to appoint one joint audit contract across all authorities, a joint panel may be more likely to advise appointment of an auditor it considers suitable for all authorities taken together</li> </ul> <p>Need to agree appointment of members across multiple authorities and set up a joint decision-making process</p>
Option 3 – Public Sector Audit Appointments Limited (PSAA) - The national scheme for appointing local auditors	A not-for-profit company established by the Local Government Association (LGA). Administer the current audit contracts, let by the Audit Commission before it closed.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The costs of setting up the appointment arrangements and negotiating fees would be shared across all opt-in authorities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Individual elected members will have less opportunity for direct involvement in the appointment process other than</li> </ul>

	<p>PSAA have the support of the LGA, which has worked to secure the option for principal local government and police bodies to appoint auditors through a dedicated sector-led national procurement body. PSAA have established an advisory panel, drawn from representative groups of local government and police bodies, to give access to Authorities' views on the design and operation of the scheme.</p> <p>PSAA have been specified by the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government as the appointing person for principal local government bodies. This means that PSAA will make auditor appointments to principal local government bodies that choose to opt into the national appointment arrangements PSAA will operate for audits of the accounts from 2018/19.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• By offering large contract values the firms would be able to offer better rates and lower fees than are likely to result from local negotiation</li> <li>• Any conflicts at individual authorities would be managed by the PSAA who would have a number of contracted firms to call upon.</li> <li>• The appointment process would not be ceded to locally appointed independent members. Instead a separate body set up to act in the collective interests of the 'opt-in' authorities.</li> <li>• Avoiding the necessity for the Authority to establish an auditor panel and to undertake an auditor procurement;</li> <li>• Savings from one major procurement as opposed to running an individual or East Sussex-wide procurement exercise;</li> <li>• Securing highly competitive prices from audit firms through economies of scale;</li> <li>• A scale of fees which reflects size, complexity and audit risk;</li> <li>• Distribution of surpluses to participating bodies;</li> <li>• Appointment of the same auditors to bodies involved in significant collaboration/joint working initiatives or across regions, where the parties believe that it will enhance efficiency and value for money.</li> </ul>	<p>through the LGA and/or stakeholder representative groups.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In order for the PSAA to be viable and to be placed in the strongest possible negotiating position the PSAA will need authorities to indicate their intention to opt-in before final contract prices are known.</li> </ul>
--	---	---	--

27 October 2016

**Email:** [appointingperson@psaa.co.uk](mailto:appointingperson@psaa.co.uk)

Gary Walsh  
East Sussex Fire Authority  
Headquarters  
20 Upperton Road  
Eastbourne East Sussex BN21 1EU

Copied to: Duncan Savage, Treasurer, East Sussex Fire Authority

Dear Mr Walsh

## **Invitation to opt into the national scheme for auditor appointments**

As you know the external auditor for the audit of the accounts for 2018/19 has to be appointed before the end of 2017. That may seem a long way away, but as there is now a choice about how to make that appointment, a decision on your authority's approach will be needed soon.

We are pleased that the Secretary of State has expressed his confidence in us by giving us the role of appointing local auditors under a national scheme. This is one choice open to your authority. We issued a prospectus about the scheme in July 2016, available to download on the [appointing person](#) page of our website, with other information you may find helpful.

The timetable we have outlined for appointing auditors under the scheme means we now need to issue a formal invitation to opt into these arrangements. The covering email provides the formal invitation, along with a form of acceptance of our invitation for you to use if your authority decides to join the national scheme. We believe the case for doing so is compelling. To help with your decision we have prepared the additional information attached to this letter.

I need to highlight two things:

- we need to receive your formal acceptance of this invitation by 9 March 2017; and
- the relevant regulations require that, except for a body that is a corporation sole (a police and crime commissioner), the decision to accept the invitation and to opt in needs to be made by the members of the authority meeting as a whole. We appreciate this will need to be built into your decision making timetable.

If you have any other questions not covered by our information, do not hesitate to contact us by email at [appointingperson@psaa.co.uk](mailto:appointingperson@psaa.co.uk).

Yours sincerely



Jon Hayes, Chief Officer

## **Appointing an external auditor**

### **Information on the national scheme**

#### **Public Sector Audit Appointments Limited (PSAA)**

We are a not-for-profit company established by the Local Government Association (LGA). We administer the current audit contracts, let by the Audit Commission before it closed.

We have the support of the LGA, which has worked to secure the option for principal local government and police bodies to appoint auditors through a dedicated sector-led national procurement body. We have established an advisory panel, drawn from representative groups of local government and police bodies, to give access to your views on the design and operation of the scheme.

#### **The national scheme for appointing local auditors**

We have been specified by the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government as the appointing person for principal local government bodies. This means that we will make auditor appointments to principal local government bodies that choose to opt into the national appointment arrangements we will operate for audits of the accounts from 2018/19. These arrangements are sometimes described as the 'sector-led body' option, and our thinking for this scheme was set out in a prospectus circulated to you in July. The prospectus is available on the [appointing person](#) page of our website.

We will appoint an auditor for all opted-in authorities for each of the five financial years beginning from 1 April 2018, unless the Secretary of State chooses to terminate our role as the appointing person beforehand. He or she may only do so after first consulting opted-in authorities and the LGA.

#### **What the appointing person scheme will offer**

We are committed to making sure the national scheme will be an excellent option for auditor appointments for you.

We intend to run the scheme in a way that will save time and resources for local government bodies. We think that a collective procurement, which we will carry out on behalf of all opted-in authorities, will enable us to secure the best prices, keeping the cost of audit as low as possible for the bodies who choose to opt in, without compromising on audit quality.

Our current role means we have a unique experience and understanding of auditor procurement and the local public audit market.

Using the scheme will avoid the need for you to:

- establish an audit panel with independent members;
- manage your own auditor procurement and cover its costs;
- monitor the independence of your appointed auditor for the duration of the appointment;
- deal with the replacement of any auditor if required; and
- manage the contract with your auditor.

Our scheme will endeavour to appoint the same auditors to other opted-in bodies that are involved in formal collaboration or joint working initiatives, if you consider that a common auditor will enhance efficiency and value for money.

We will also try to be flexible about changing your auditor during the five-year appointing period if there is good reason, for example where new joint working arrangements are put in place.

Securing a high level of acceptances to the opt-in invitation will provide the best opportunity for us to achieve the most competitive prices from audit firms. The LGA has previously sought expressions of interest in the appointing person arrangements, and received positive responses from over 270 relevant authorities. We ultimately hope to achieve participation from the vast majority of eligible authorities.

### **High quality audits**

The Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 provides that firms must be registered as local public auditors with one of the chartered accountancy institutes acting in the capacity of a Recognised Supervisory Body (RSB). The quality of registered firms' work will be subject to scrutiny by both the RSB and the Financial Reporting Council (FRC), under arrangements set out in the Act.

We will:

- only contract with audit firms that have a proven track record in undertaking public audit work;
- include obligations in relation to maintaining and continuously improving quality in our contract terms and in the quality criteria in our tender evaluation;
- ensure that firms maintain the appropriate registration and will liaise closely with RSBs and the FRC to ensure that any quality concerns are detected at an early stage; and
- take a close interest in your feedback and in the rigour and effectiveness of firms' own quality assurance arrangements.

We will also liaise with the National Audit Office to help ensure that guidance to auditors is updated as necessary.

### **Procurement strategy**

In developing our procurement strategy for the contracts with audit firms, we will have input from the advisory panel we have established. The panel will assist PSAA in developing arrangements for the national scheme, provide feedback to us on proposals as they develop, and helping us maintain effective channels of communication. We think it is particularly important to understand your preferences and priorities, to ensure we develop a strategy that reflects your needs within the constraints set out in legislation and in professional requirements.

In order to secure the best prices we are minded to let audit contracts:

- for 5 years;
- in 2 large contract areas nationally, with 3 or 4 contract lots per area, depending on the number of bodies that opt in; and
- to a number of firms in each contract area to help us manage independence issues.

The value of each contract will depend on the prices bid, with the firms offering the best value being awarded larger amounts of work. By having contracts with a number of firms, we will be able to manage issues of independence and avoid dominance of the market by one or two firms. Limiting the national volume of work available to any one firm will encourage competition and ensure the plurality of provision.

## **Auditor appointments and independence**

Auditors must be independent of the bodies they audit, to enable them to carry out their work with objectivity and credibility, and in a way that commands public confidence.

We plan to take great care to ensure that every auditor appointment passes this test. We will also monitor significant proposals for auditors to carry out consultancy or other non-audit work, to protect the independence of auditor appointments.

We will consult you on the appointment of your auditor, most likely from September 2017. To make the most effective allocation of appointments, it will help us to know about:

- any potential constraints on the appointment of your auditor because of a lack of independence, for example as a result of consultancy work awarded to a particular firm;
- any joint working or collaboration arrangements that you think should influence the appointment; and
- other local factors you think are relevant to making the appointment.

We will ask you for this information after you have opted in.

Auditor appointments for the audit of the accounts of the 2018/19 financial year must be made by 31 December 2017.

## **Fee scales**

We will ensure that fee levels are carefully managed by securing competitive prices from firms and by minimising our own costs. Any surplus funds will be returned to scheme members under our articles of association and our memorandum of understanding with the Department for Communities and Local Government and the LGA.

Our costs for setting up and managing the scheme will need to be covered by audit fees. We expect our annual operating costs will be lower than our current costs because we expect to employ a smaller team to manage the scheme. We are intending to fund an element of the costs of establishing the scheme, including the costs of procuring audit contracts, from local government's share of our current deferred income. We think this is appropriate because the new scheme will be available to all relevant principal local government bodies.

PSAA will pool scheme costs and charge fees to audited bodies in accordance with a fair scale of fees which has regard to size, complexity and audit risk, most likely as evidenced by audit fees for 2016/17. Pooling means that everyone in the scheme will benefit from the most competitive prices. Fees will reflect the number of scheme participants – the greater the level of participation, the better the value represented by our scale fees.

Scale fees will be determined by the prices achieved in the auditor procurement that PSAA will need to undertake during the early part of 2017. Contracts are likely to be awarded at the end of June 2017, and at this point the overall cost and therefore the level of fees required will be clear. We expect to consult on the proposed scale of fees in autumn 2017 and to publish the fees applicable for 2018/19 in March 2018.



## Opting in

The closing date for opting in is 9 March 2017. We have allowed more than the minimum eight week notice period required, because the formal approval process for most eligible bodies, except police and crime commissioners, is a decision made by the members of an authority meeting as a whole.

We will confirm receipt of all opt-in notices. A full list of authorities who opt in will be published on our website. Once we have received an opt-in notice, we will write to you to request information on any joint working arrangements relevant to your auditor appointment, and any potential independence matters that would prevent us appointing a particular firm.

If you decide not to accept the invitation to opt in by the closing date, you may subsequently make a request to opt in, but only after 1 April 2018. The earliest an auditor appointment can be made for authorities that opt in after the closing date is therefore for the audit of the accounts for 2019/20. We are required to consider such requests, and agree to them unless there are reasonable grounds for their refusal.

## Timetable

In summary, we expect the timetable for the new arrangements to be:

- Invitation to opt in issued 27 October 2016
- Closing date for receipt of notices to opt in 9 March 2017
- Contract notice published 20 February 2017
- Award audit contracts By end of June 2017
- Consult on and make auditor appointments By end of December 2017
- Consult on and publish scale fees By end of March 2018

## Enquiries

We publish frequently asked questions on our [website](#). We are keen to receive feedback from local bodies on our plans. Please email your feedback or questions to: [appointingperson@psaa.co.uk](mailto:appointingperson@psaa.co.uk).

If you would like to discuss a particular issue with us, please send an email to the above address, and we will make arrangements either to telephone or meet you.



**Form of notice of acceptance of the invitation to opt in**

(Please use the details and text below to submit to PSAA your authority's formal notice of acceptance of the invitation to opt into the appointing person arrangements)

To: [appointingperson@psaa.co.uk](mailto:appointingperson@psaa.co.uk)

Subject: [Name of authority]

**Notice of acceptance of the invitation to become an opted-in authority**

This email is notice of the acceptance of your invitation dated 27 October 2016 to become an opted-in authority for the purposes of the appointment of our auditor under the provisions of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 and the requirements of the Local Audit (Appointing Person) Regulations 2015.

I confirm that [name of authority] has made the decision to accept your invitation to become an opted-in authority in accordance with the decision making requirements of the Regulations and that I am authorised to sign this notice of acceptance on behalf of the authority.

Name: [Name of signatory]

Title: [Role title] (authorised officer)

For and on behalf of: [Name of authority]

Date: